

Adapted from Jeff Miller's lecture notes at  
*[debate.uvm.edu/dcpdf/Miller\\_introto\*\*kritik\*\*.pdf](http://debate.uvm.edu/dcpdf/Miller_introto<b>kritik</b>.pdf)*

# KRITIKS

# Overview

- ⦿ Components of a Kritik
- ⦿ Types of Kritiks
- ⦿ Answers to Kritiks
- ⦿ Terminology of Kritiks

# Components

- DA

Uniqueness →

Brink →

Link →

Impacts →

## Kritik

Link

Implications

Alternative

# Components

- ⦿ Think of a Kritik like this:

Kritik = DA + Counter Plan

- ⦿ Thus, Neg accepts burdens of *both* arguments
  - In CX, ask how the Alternative solves (not just what it is, but how it solves)
  - Alternative (i.e., counter plan component) requires solvency

# Types

- ⦿ Rhetorical Kritik
- ⦿ Assumption Kritik
- ⦿ Structural Kritik
- ⦿ Structural Assumption Kritik

# Rhetorical

## ⦿ Characteristics

- Used when opponent uses or fails to use specific terminology

## ⦿ Examples:

- Terror Talk
- Feminism

# Assumption Kritik

- ⦿ Characteristics

- Attacks the assumptions of the opponent

- ⦿ Example:

- Realism (Neg Strategy)
  - Threat Construction (Aff Critique)

# Structural Kritik

## ⦿ Characteristics:

- Based off the structure of the Aff case/Neg strategy
- Links into Aff plan text

## ⦿ Example

- Militarism



# Structural Assumption Kritik

## ⦿ Characteristics:

- Combination of Assumption and Structural Kritik
- most common type of critique
- Often use one philosopher's thoughts on a specific issue and just expand

## ⦿ Examples:

- Foucault, Spanos
- Imperialism, Empire

# Terminology

## ⦿ Pre-Fiat

- “Before Fiat” such as T and Plan implications

## ⦿ Epistemology

- How we come to know
- Foundation for Mimesis and Realism Kritiks

## ⦿ Ontology/Deontology

- Study of being

# Terminology

- ⦿ Consequentialism (Camus and Callahan) (Aff)
  - Aff. use against DAs
  - Inaction leads to individual and government tyranny
- ⦿ Utilitarianism (Neg)
  - Aff. takes a utopian approach to debate that oversimplifies harms and solvency
  - should focus on valuing life rather than number of people saved

# Terminology

## ⦿ Postmodernism

- Emphasizes need for micro-theory focusing on difference rather than holistic macro-theory
- Foucault
- Lyotard

## ⦿ Psychoanalysis

- Deals with Fantasy vs. Real World
- Lacan
- Žižek

# Terminology

- ◎ Neo-Liberalism
  - Capitalism/Marxism
  - Karl Marx good;
  - Adam Smith bad (usually)

# Terminology

## ⊙ Security/Realism

- Ex: Securitization → Imperialism
- Realism says humans are “ugly on the inside” and nothing is higher than the state; States act rationally; state institution (UN) are anarchical

## ⊙ Militarism

- Asks the question: Is it ok to use the military to get the job done?

# Terminology

- ⊙ States

- Says the State (i.e. Nation-State) is bad

- ⊙ Bio Power (Foucault)

- Panopticon—power is present but accepted

- ⊙ Compassion Fatigue

- Showing suffering dehumanizes/fatigues

- Empire

- Terrorism replaces the nation-state as the enemy

# Ableism/Mobility

- Gleeson, B. (1999). Justice and the disabling city. *Sage Urban Studies Abstracts*, 27(3).
- As Hahn observes: "In terms of ease or comfort, most cities have been designed not merely for the nondisabled but for a physical ideal that few human beings can ever hope to approximate" (1986, p. 273). For disabled people, these pervasive mobility handicaps are more than simply the quotidian urban frictions (e.g., public transport delays, road blockages, freak weather, periodic crowding) that irritate the lives of non disabled people. Rather, discriminatory design is a critical manifestation, and cause, of social oppression because it reduces the ability of disabled people to participate fully in urban life.



# Anthropocentrism/Heidegger

- ◉ Kevin Michael DeLuca, Associate Professor of Speech Communication and adjunct in the Institute of Ecology at the University of Georgia, author of *Image Politics: The New Rhetoric of Environmental Activism* and numerous articles exploring humanity-nature relations and technology, 2005, "Thinking with Heidegger Rethinking Environmental Theory and Practice", in *Ethics & the Environment* 10.1 p. 67-87
- Heidegger prophetically predicts that machination will produce "a gigantic progress of sciences in the future. These advancements will bring exploitation and usage of the earth as well as rearing and training of humans into conditions that are still inconceivable today" (1999, 108). Animals and plants are reduced to various forms of use value and, more significantly, are banished from Being-in-the-world with us: "What is a plant and an animal to us anymore, when we take away use, embellishment, and entertainment" (1999, 194). "Nature" suffers a similar fate: "What happens to nature in technicity, when nature is separated out from beings by the natural sciences? The growing—or better, the simple rolling unto its end—destruction of 'nature'.... And finally what was left was only 'scenery' and recreational opportunity and even this still calculated into the gigantic and arranged for the masses" (1999, 195). Under the unrestrained domination of machination, humans suffer a "hollowing out" (1999, 91, 348) and Being-in-the-world is replaced by "adventures."

# Apocalyptic Rhetoric

- Davidson, 2000 (Carlos) *BioScience* 50(5):433-440. 2000 “Economic Growth and the Environment: Alternatives to the Limits Paradigm.”
  - The limits perspective leads people to focus on pointing out limits and to emphasize the catastrophe that awaits if the limits are transgressed. As a consequence, writing about environmental degradation often has an apocalyptic tone. Environmentalists have often predicted impending catastrophes (e.g., oil depletion, absolute food shortages and mass starvation, or biological collapse). This catastrophism is ultimately damaging to the cause of environmental protection. First, predictions of catastrophe, like the boy who cries wolf, at first motivate people's concern, but when the threat repeatedly turns out to be less severe than predicted, people ignore future warnings. Secondly, the belief in impending catastrophe has in the past led some environmentalists to support withholding food and medical aid to poor nations (Hardin 1972), forced sterilization (Ehrlich 1968), and other repressive measures. Not only are these positions repulsive from a social justice perspective, they also misdirect energy away from real solutions.

# Bataille

- Land 1992 – lecturer in Continental Philosophy at Warwick University. Land, N. (1992). *The thirst for annihilation: Georges Bataille and virulent nihilism: An essay in atheistic religion*. London; New York: Routledge. pg. 23-24]
- Excess or surplus always precedes production, work, seriousness, exchange, and lack. Need is never given, it must be constructed out of luxuriance. The primordial task of life is not to produce or survive, but to consume the clogging floods of riches—of energy—pouring down upon it. He states this boldly in his magnificent line: ‘The world...is sick with wealth’ [VII 15]. Expenditure, or sacrificial consumption, is not an appeal, an exchange, or a negotiation, but an uninhibited wastage that returns energy to its solar trajectory, releasing it back into the movement of dissipation that the terrestrial system—culminating in restricted human economies— momentarily arrests. Voluptuary destruction is the only end of energy, a process of liquidation that can be suspended by the accumulative efforts whose zenith form is that of the capitalist bourgeoisie, but only for a while.

# Capitalism/Neo-Liberalism

- Sheppard, E. (1990). Transportation in a capitalist space-economy: transportation demand, circulation time, and transportation innovations. *Environment and Planning A*, 22(8), 1007 – 1024. doi:10.1068/a221007
  - Transportation, as the service of moving commodities between places, plays a unique role in a fully competitive capitalist space-economy. The commodity of transportation is consumed as a part of virtually every economic transaction, linking the production and consumption of a commodity; demand for transportation is derived from spatial configurations rather than being fixed by socially necessary techniques and real wages; and the circulation time taken in transportation is a deduction from capitalists' profits. The impact of circulation time on profits may be calculated precisely. The derived nature of the demand for transportation adds a level of uncertainty to the impact of cost-reducing technical change on profit rates. Given this, cost-reducing and time-reducing technical change in the transportation commodity is one of the few ways of ensuring an increased rate of profit for capitalists, ceteris paribus. The public nature of transportation improvements and the high investments in fixed capital that are required help to explain the central role of the state in capitalism in the improvement of transportation and thus in underwriting capital accumulation.

# Competitiveness in Capitalism—Discourse of Hegemony

- Schoenberger, E. (1998). Discourse and practice in human geography. *Progress in Human Geography*, 22(1), 1–14. doi: 10.1191/030913298675930041
- More than that, though, 'competitiveness' seems to me a term that has become truly hegemonic in the Gramscian sense. It is a culturally and socially sanctioned category that, when invoked, can completely halt public discussion of public or private activities. There is virtually no counterargument available to the simple claim that 'doing X will make us uncompetitive,' whatever X and whomever 'us' might be. In a capitalist society, of course, it is more than reasonable to be concerned with competition and competitiveness. No matter what your theoretical orientation, mainstream to Marxist, these must be seen as real forces shaping real outcomes in society. They are not just intellectual constructs that lend a false sense of order to a messy world.

# Feminism/Gender

- Perkin 2007 (Patricia E., Faculty of Environmental Studies, York University, “Feminist Ecological Economics and Sustainability” JOURNAL OF BIOECONOMICS Volume 9, Number 3 (2007)
  - In part, the emphasis on the work-trip was a response to social change, as economic restructuring and a growing service sector generated new working conditions and labour demands for women in developed countries. But interest in the work-trip also derives in part from its power as a metaphor, both for women’s lives and for feminist geography. The work-trip is the single human activity that most clearly bridges the symbolic and spatial distinction between public and private which is a feature of western urbanism. It is the actual and metaphoric link between the spheres and spaces of production and reproduction, work and home. Serious attention to the work-trip unsettles the neat binary of separate spheres, and forces us to recognize the messy interwoven reality of daily life. The topic of the work-trip has thus served as a way of dissolving conceptual boundaries. The focus on employed women challenges the crude association of ‘women = home/men = paid work’, and reminds us that men’s lives also include a domestic component.

# Foucault—Critical Infrastructure Protection and a Link to Terrorism

- Lundborg and Vaughn-Williams, 2011 [Tom, Swedish Institute of International Affairs, and Nick, Associate Professor of International Security at the University of Warwick, “Resilience, Critical Infrastructure, and Molecular Security: The Excess of “Life” in Biopolitics.” *International Political Sociology*, Vol. 5. Issue 4. December 2011, 367-383, Accessed Online via Wiley Online Library]
- More importantly, resilient CIs are also necessary for the optimization of virtual (that is pre-emptive) tactics against the becoming-dangerous of bodies-in-information: tactics upon which the edifice of liberal rule ultimately rests. Moreover, Dillon and Reid shrewdly observe that the perception of “terrorist threats” in Western societies enables liberal regimes to further develop and entrench CIs, in turn extending and intensifying biopolitical control over life.

# Race

- Bullard, R., Johnson, G. S., & Torres, A. O. (2000). *Sprawl City: Race, Politics, and Planning in Atlanta*. Island Press. p. 46
- Generally, transportation amenities (benefits) accrue to the wealthier and more educated segment of society, while transportation disamenities (burdens) fall disproportionately on people of color and individuals at the lower end of the socioeconomic spectrum. Intergenerational equity issues are also subsumed under this category. The impacts and consequences of some transportation decisions may reach into several generations. Heavy government investment in road infrastructure may be contributing to an increase in household transportation costs. Lest anyone dismiss transportation as a tangential issue, consider that Americans spend more on transportation than any other household expense except housing.



# Security/Critical Infrastructure Protection

- Dunn Cavelty, M., & Kristensen, K. S. (2008). *Securing “the homeland”: critical infrastructure, risk and (in)security*. London; New York: Routledge. pg 5-6
- Thus, CIP approaches the threat of terrorism not through surveillance and interdiction, but through a different form of security that is oriented toward ensuring the continuous functioning of critical systems. The second, broader perspective sees CIP as an important subset of homeland security and counter-terrorism (Part II). In this understanding, CIP is also about technology of control, constituting both a threat and a means of protection, and technological developments within a broader social and political frame, including surveillance. In this view, CIP functions as a framework for the establishment of new degrees and techniques of control over the properties and processes of life. The important point here is the conflation of the human body, of technology and of knowledge in the practice of CIP.

# Nietzsche—Suffering is good. Embrace it.

- Kain, professor of philosophy at Santa Clara, 2007 [Philip J., “Nietzsche, Eternal Recurrence, and the Horror of Existence,” *Journal of Nietzsche Studies* 33 (2007), 49-63] pp. 50-51
- For Nietzsche, we must stop wasting time and energy hoping to change things, improve them, make progress (see, e.g., WP 40, 90, 684)—the outlook of liberals, socialists, and even Christians, all of whom Nietzsche tends to lump together and excoriate. For Nietzsche, we cannot reduce suffering, and to keep hoping that we can will simply weaken us. Instead, we must conceal an alien and terrifying cosmos if we hope to live in it. And we must develop the strength to do so. We must toughen ourselves. We need more suffering, not less.

# Virilio—Speed Kills

- Kuswa, 2004 – P.h. D. in Rhetoric from UT, Department of Rhetoric and Communication Studies at Richmond (Kevin, Machinic Rhetoric, Highways and Interpellating Motions, Rhizomes, <http://www.rhizomes.net/issue8/kuswa.htm>) //BZ
- 
- The body is already ground-breaking in both everyday and revolutionary ways. The body is organic and machinic as it moves from one mode to another: by operating the speed and acceleration of a motorized vehicle, by strapping to a chair via a seat belt, and by obeying or breaking speed limit laws. In sum, we should take the body's relation to the road, the vehicle, and the accident as crucial sites of modernity's concentrations and movements.

# Car Culture—More Capitalism is Bad

- Engler 2011 – Former Vice President of the Concordia Student Union, activist and author living in Montreal (Yves, “Cars and capitalism”, *Synthesis/Regeneration*, Fall 2011, Gale Academic OneFile)
  - When all is said and done, cars facilitate an extra large culture, which is grand for business. Propelling the capitalist economic system full speed ahead, the automobile is a vehicle of endless consumption. Capitalism would prefer everyone traveling to the grocery store by private jet, but since that's not practical 3,000- or 4,000-pound metal boxes will have to do. The car's ability to generate business explains in large part why public monies are overwhelmingly devoted to this dangerous, unhealthy and unsustainable form of transport. Those who want cities structured for safer and more ecologically sustainable forms of transport need to challenge, rather than reinforce, the idea that transit policy should be designed to expand profits. Proponents of the bike and walking will thrive as more people challenge the logic of a system driven by the endless accumulation of profit.

# Answers

## ⦿ Perm

- Permutation – the combination of ideologies
- Perm = Plan Text + Alternative
- DO NOT just say “Do Both”

## ⦿ No Link

- As with a DA, examine the link to your case. Take on an Assumption or Situational lens (whichever the opponent *doesn't* use)

# Answers

- ◎ Turn (either or, not both)
  - Impact Turn
    - Works best with Capitalism and imperialism (i.e. how they are great and lead to economic/social good)
  - Link Turn
    - A link turn will turn the link and the plan will solve the impacts

# Answers

## ⦿ No Alternative

- Kritik provides no Alternative
- If rejection is only alternative, there is no alternative to status quo except Aff case to solve harms → press Uniqueness at this point

## ⦿ Impact Defense

- Like “impacts empirically denied” meaning the impacts would have happened already if true

# Answers

## ⊙ Impacts Calculus

- Probability
  - Contrast reasonable likelihood of Critique impacts versus consequences of failing to solve Aff harms
- Timeframe
  - If this hasn't happened yet, when will it happen (hundred year old philosophers... still waiting)
- Magnitude
  - Net benefits comparison (hurt feelings versus the 2<sup>nd</sup> Holocaust)



# Answers

- ⦿ Aff Case is a DA to the Alternative
  - The Alternative cannot solve the case
  - Apply Counter Plan solvency burdens to Negative Alternative (i.e., Plan-meets-Need)
- ⦿ Counter Critique
  - Works best on critiques like Empire (counter-critique is Eurocentrism) or Foucault to Gender/Feminism

# Review

- ⦿ Components of a Kritik
- ⦿ Types of Kritiks
- ⦿ Answers to Kritiks
- ⦿ Terminology of Kritiks